

## ICES Request Form

Request from	European Commission, DG MARE C1
Contact within organisation	<hr/>
Content contact person	I
Request announced	
Request received	
Answer deadline client	
Request code (client)	23_08 Multi-annual advice
Request code (ICES)	
Request	Identification of EU-only and Baltic Sea stocks eligible for a multiannual advice (point 1 of the request) and identification of path to multiannual advice for these and other stocks (point 2 of the request)

### Background

ICES and requesters discussed multiannual fishing opportunities advice during the MIRIA meeting held in January 2023. Overall, managers' concerns relate to the expectation for more uncertainty in the multiannual advice and how this would impact on the quotas advised, when at the same time, fisheries stakeholders and managers have called for more stability in setting the fishing opportunities.

Preparatory to the present request are the following clarifications:

- The present request covers EU-only and Baltic Sea stocks for which the EU (DG MARE) is the only advice requester (Annex 1).
- Multiannual advice is here defined as advice not provided on an annual basis but instead for a period of two or more years while recommending catches for every year in that period, due to a less frequent assessment (i.e. not yearly). Such advice should meet the requirements for the headline advice set out in the latest ICES-DG MARE grant agreement, and this for every year for which catch recommendations are provided. ICES developed criteria in 2016 for implementing such multiannual advice ('ICES multiannual advice criteria', Annex 2), which ICES recalled at the MIRIA meeting held in January 2023 (MIRIA/January/2023 Doc 5d).

### Request

#### Part 1

##### 1. Multiannual advice

Based on the latest available assessment and/or the retrospective forecast, ICES is requested to consider all EU-only stocks in the northeast Atlantic and all stocks in the Baltic Sea (set out in the Annex to this request) in relation to the ICES multiannual advice criteria and to list:

- 1.1 Stocks whose assessments falls in ICES Category 1 and 2 and that meet the ICES first set of criteria for less frequent assessment;
- 1.2 Stocks whose assessments falls in ICES Category 1 and 2 and that meet ICES second set of criteria for less frequent assessment;

- 1.3 Stocks whose assessments falls in ICES in Category 3 to 6 for which less frequent assessments are already provided;
- 1.4 Stocks whose assessments falls in ICES in Category 3 to 6 for which less frequent assessments are not yet provided and – in case – reasons for which are not possible to be provided.

For each stock listed under points 1.1, 1.2, and 1.4, ICES is requested to report the possible scenarios on the advice frequency.

## Part 2

### 2. Meeting requirements and criteria

- 2.1 In addition, for stocks for which it recommends multiannual advice (as identified under Part 1 points 1.1, 1.2), ICES is requested to confirm that the requirements for the headline advice set out in the latest ICES-DG MARE grant agreement are met, and this for every year for which catches are recommended.

DG MARE would understand that for stocks listed under point 1.3 the requirements for the headline advice set out in the latest ICES- DG MARE grant agreement are met.

- 2.2 Should the assessment under point 2.1 show that the requirements set out in the latest ICES-DG MARE grant agreement are not met for any of the stocks, DG MARE requests ICES to identify ways of meeting these requirements for these stocks. Such ways may include: (i) (catch) control rules to be applied when providing catch recommendations; and (ii) possible other ways of meeting the requirements set out in the latest ICES-DG MARE grant agreement.

- 2.3 ICES is requested to identify a process to be applied in the intermediate year(s) for assessing whether the assumptions used in the advice remain valid, but without conducting a full assessment. Such a process may be a way of meeting the requirements set out in the latest ICES-DG MARE grant agreement, as referred to in point 2.1.

- 2.4 For EU-only stocks in the northeast Atlantic and all stocks in the Baltic Sea (set out in Annex 1) which do not fall under points 1.1, 1.2 or 1.4, ICES is requested to identify ways of meeting in the future, where possible, the second set of criteria for less frequent assessment. Such ways could include those referred to in points 2.2 and 2.3.

- 2.5 In addition, for stocks identified under point 2.4, ICES is requested to conduct an assessment in line with point 2.1 and, where relevant, identify ways of meeting the requirements set out in the latest ICES-DG MARE grant agreement.

- 2.6 ICES is requested to conduct a review of approaches implemented in other geographical areas in order to identify: Lessons learnt/best practices in relation to 2.2 and 2.3.

DG MARE understands from ICES that work in relation to point 2.3 of this request may be extensive and its outcome may impact different elements of this request. ICES may therefore consider first releasing advice regarding part 1 and points 2.1 and 2.3 of this request. In that case, it may be appropriate for point 2.2 and 2.4 to 2.6 of this request to be revised by DG MARE on the basis of that advice.

## Annex 1 – List of EU-only stocks in the northeast Atlantic and all stocks in the Baltic Sea

- ane.27.8
- ane.27.9a
- cod.27.21
- meg.27.8c9a

- ldb.27.8c9a
- ank.27.8c9a
- mon.27.8c9a
- whg.27.89a
- hke.27.8c9a
- nep.fu.3-4
- nep.fu.2324
- nep.fu.25
- nep.fu.31
- nep.fu.2627
- nep.fu.2829
- nep.fu.30
- ple.27.21-23
- ple.27.7bc
- ple.27.89a
- pol.27.89a
- pol.27.89a
- pol.27.89a
- sol.27.20-24
- sol.27.7bc
- sol.27.8ab
- sol.27.8c9a
- hom.27.9a
- sbr.27.9
- her.27.3031
- her.27.25-2932
- her.27.28
- cod.27.24-32
- cod.27.22-24
- ple.27.24-32
- sal.27.22-31
- sal.27.32
- spr.27.22-32

## Annex 2 – ICES criteria for multiannual assessment

*'First set'*: Stocks are considered candidates for biennial assessment if:

- The advice for the stock has been 0-catch or equivalent for the latest three advice years.

*'Second set'*: Stocks are considered candidates for biennial assessment if the following criteria are fulfilled simultaneously:

- Life span (i.e. maximum normal age) of the species is larger than 5 years
- The stock status in relation to the reference points is according to the MSY criteria  $F(\text{latest assessment year}) \leq 1.1 \times F_{\text{msy}}$  OR if  $F_{\text{msy}}$  range has been defined:  $F(\text{latest assessment year}) \leq F_{\text{upper}}$  (upper bound in F range) AND  $\text{SSB}(\text{start of intermediate year}) \geq \text{MSY } B_{\text{trigger}}$
- The average contribution to the catch in numbers of the recruiting year class in latest 5 years is less than 25% of the total catch in numbers. Should be calculated as the average over the latest five years of the catch in numbers of first age divided by the total catch in number by year
- The retrospective pattern, based on a 5 years peel of Mohn's Rho index, shows that F is consistently underestimated by less than 20%.

Planning ICES	<p>Phase 1:</p> <p>Technical service providing a table of the stocks outlined in the Annex to the request concerning their placement in relation to the ICES criteria for multi annual advice.</p> <p>Most of this information is available in the Stock Information Database (SID), the Advice and Scenarios Database (ASD), and the Stock Assessment Graphs (SAG). WG reports will be consulted to estimate the contribution of the recruiting year class to the catches, and the Mohn's rho database (5-year peels) will be used for the last criterium.</p> <p>Phase 2:</p> <p>A technical meeting with DGMARE outlining the framework for phase 2 will be held in the beginning of 2023.</p> <p>A workshop will be held to:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Consider whether the requirements for the headline advice set out in the latest ICES-DG MARE grant agreement are met for all stocks that meet the criteria for multiannual advice.</li> <li>2. Propose methods to ensure the requirements for headline advice are met for those stocks where potential issues are identified.</li> <li>3. Consider what needs to be updated and assessed in the intermediate year.</li> <li>4. Determine appropriate methods to examine whether or not advice remains appropriate in the intermediate year. These methods should not require a full assessment of the stock but rather be more simple methods examining potential indicators.</li> <li>5. Consider if any of the stocks not meeting the criteria for multiannual advice could realistically meet these criteria in future.</li> <li>6. Conduct a review of approaches towards assessment frequency that are used in other parts of the world, including by national governments and RFMOs.</li> <li>7. Summarise methods and output of the WK as a draft Technical guideline</li> </ol> <p>Outcomes of this workshop will include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Points 1,2 and 5: A table of all qualifying stocks describing whether or not multi-annual advice can be appropriately provided, or what would be required in order to achieve this in future.</li> <li>- Point 4: A report describing methods that can be used to determine whether update advice is needed in the intermediate year. Existing approaches that have been applied in ICES will be considered e.g. the in-year reopening of advice for North Sea stocks and the framework of indicators approach used for salmon stocks in the NEA. The new Category 3 empirical assessment methods were specifically evaluated to be appropriate for multiannual advice, so will not require intermediate year examinations.</li> <li>- Point 6: A report including a review of approaches used globally. The USA has a formalised system for determining which stocks need assessments each year, but approaches used in other countries and RFMOs will be examined.</li> <li>- Point 7: Technical guidelines document to ensure consistent appropriate methods are applied. Relevant stock annexes to be updated with the new procedures.</li> <li>- A draft advice summarising the key points of the WK.</li> </ul>
Request (budget) accepted	
ICES contact person	
WG(s) involved	HAWG, WGBFAS, WGBIE, WGCSE, WGDEEP, WGHANSA, WGNSSK.
Preparation timing	<p><b>Phase 1</b></p> <p><b>November 2023:</b> ICES Secretariat to produce a technical service applying the ICES criteria for multiannual assessment to all listed stocks.</p> <p><b>November 2023:</b> Following ACOM approval, the technical service including the list</p>

	<p>of stocks that are candidates for multiannual advice will published and be available for Phase 2.</p> <p><b>Phase 2</b></p> <p><b>February 2024:</b> Technical meeting with DGMARE to discuss the technical service from Phase 1. Identify stocks for which a change to multiannual advice is recommended.</p> <p><b>March 2024:</b> ACOM annual meeting discuss the subsequent phase 2 in relation to WKNEWREF.</p> <p><b>September 2024:</b> WKMFOA meets to address the TORs for phase 2 (above) based on the list of stocks agreed in the technical meeting with DGMARE.</p> <p><b>October 2024:</b> Report for workshop published.</p> <p><b>September 2024:</b> ADGMFOA finalises the advice</p> <p><b>October 2024:</b> ACOM approves advice WCMFOA</p> <p><b>October 2024:</b> ACOM to approve guidelines for intermediate year procedures.</p>
Review group	Two external experts to review the WKMFOA report
Advice drafting group	<p>Phase 1: NA</p> <p>Phase 2: ADGMFOA 17-18 October</p>
ACOM Webex	WCMAA 29 October
Release date	<p>Phase 1: 29 November 2023</p> <p>Phase 2: 31 October 2024</p>

Grey cells to be filled in by ICES